



IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY
Faculty Senate

Executive Board Minutes

Tuesday, December 7, 2021 – 3:00-5:00 p.m.
107 Lab of Mechanics

Present: Al Shihabi, D. (FDAR); Bennett-George, S. (Academic Affairs); Bratsch-Prince, D. (Associate Provost); Butler, A. (Secretary); Daniels, T. (COE); Day, T. (J&A); Faber, C. (Past President); Freeman, S. (Governance); Gillette, M. (CHS); Hanson, V. (CHS); Knief, A. (Parliamentarian); Muecke, M. (COD); Oberhauser, A. (RPA); Parsa, R. (COB); Perkins, J. (President-Elect); Wallace, R. (LAS); Wheeler, A. (President); Wickert, J. (Senior VP and Provost)

1. Call to Order

President Wheeler called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m. when quorum was reached.

She reminded EB members of COVID mitigation strategies and EB protocol.

2. Consent Agenda

EB Agenda December 7, 2021

EB Minutes November 2, 2021

Senator Freeman moved to reorder the items in New Business, so that the bylaw change would be considered before the minutes. President-Elect Perkins seconded. The motion was adopted, with one dissent.

With no objections, the consent agenda was adopted.

3. Unfinished Business

3.1. Undergraduate Certificate Policy [21-8] – Bennett-George

No comments

3.2. Non-substantive FH Changes [21-10] – Freeman

No comments

3.3. FS Minutes October 12 [20-11] – Butler

An objection was raised that the FS minutes included claims about what President Wheeler had said, information about discussion at an EB meeting, and Secretary Butler's opinion about those claims. Secretary Butler responded that she had said every one of those things and the entire paragraph reported her speech.

The objector was asked whether to remove those claims, and the objector withdrew the objection, which concerned accuracy and bias. Another related objection was raised that even if

those claims were stated, it is improper for minutes to record discussions in addition to actions. A separate objection was raised about the difficulty of reporting discussions at length without bias, especially when they become heated. When minutes provide so much detail, they may prohibit free expression of members.

EB members agreed to send the minutes to FS for second reading, without change.

3.4. Certificate in Science Communication [21-6] – Bennett-George

Senator Bennett-George said that the proposal was modified, so that letters of support are included from each department listed on the cover page, and no other departments are listed as collaborators. All mentions of “agriculture” are removed, except for one course that is dual-listed in AgEd and Greenlee. This revised proposal will be discussed and voted on by AAC at tomorrow’s meeting.

Secretary Butler moved to include the revised proposal on FS agenda for a second reading, pending AAC’s approval. Senator Wallace seconded. The motion was adopted without dissent.

4. New Business

4.1. FS Bylaw Change [21-12] – Freeman

Senator Freeman presented the proposed bylaws, which he described as a compromise between current practice and the guidance of Robert’s Rules, according to which no discussion is to be recorded in minutes. The proposal was adopted by Governance Council, with 8 in favor and 1 against.

One EB member raised a concern that in the absence of the context of EB’s concerns over the minutes, the proposal seems to recommend that minutes censor or selectively report the happenings of meetings.

Senator Freeman said that the proposal avoids this, by requiring the minutes to be restricted to the facts. Others suggested that it would not be possible to present a subjective view of the voting record.

A concern was raised that it is important to include some of the discussion in order to provide context of the vote. Senator Freeman said that the minutes may include a brief summary of the general discussion, but prohibits back-and-forth quoting of discussions. This would address further concerns about the growing length of the minutes over the years.

Secretary Butler raised a concern that such a restriction on the minutes would make it even harder for FS debate and discussion to be well-informed – a persistent complaint she said she has heard over the years from EB members about debate in the general senate. A careful record provides history of the reasons that senators had for adopting or rejecting proposals. If the minutes become more restricted, FS leadership should create ways to ensure that caucuses are well-informed and committees report out to senators the proposals under consideration so that the general senate’s votes are well-informed.

It was pointed out that the detailed minutes have not achieved this goal of making debates better informed: the very examples of problems that Secretary Butler cited have arisen while there were have been detailed minutes. Another response was that the docket materials, not the minutes, should provide senators with sufficient information to cast their votes.

Another concern was raised that very detailed minutes make untenured faculty or faculty of underrepresented groups uneasy about speaking, especially if their point of view differs from the view of the majority speaking.

A caucus chair pointed out that it is the duty of the caucus chair to ensure that the caucus is adequately informed about FS matters. Detailed minutes are not needed to accomplish this.

There was some agreement that it would be good for councils to be more diligent about providing minutes of their meetings. It was further recommended that there be guidelines about the content of those minutes, which can vary depending on the appointed note-keeper for the meeting. Senator Freeman thought that that was a separate issue from the proposed change to the bylaws, and did not require postponing FS discussion of this proposal.

Another concern was that detailed minutes attribute statements to named individuals. This creates the possibility of those individuals' becoming targets. It was also pointed out that sometimes people do change their minds. EB members disagreed about whether the bylaw as written made clear that only discussions needed to be anonymized, not all announcements or reports.

It was clarified that the proposed bylaw change includes more than Robert's Rules recommends, allowing record of failed motions and brief summaries of discussions. Several EB members thought that it was important to retain some summary of the major points of discussion, not just a record of the vote. EB members were divided about whether the proposed bylaw change clearly allowed this.

Another concern was raised that once adopted, minutes become public documents.

Multiple EB members raised concerns about how much detail is too much, and how to ensure that summaries are not biased. Whether to include an objection is a judgment call, and whether that objection is salient depends on the narrator's point of view. Some EB members thought that a straightforward proposal of omitting details would achieve greater neutrality.

Another point was made that who speaks or which points of view receive greatest time is not necessarily indicative of the view of the entire body. Detailed reporting of discussions would provide a distorted representation of the body. Secretary Butler pointed out that the vote is also recorded. But, she held, it is important to retain the discussion, to record which reasons were offered and that the body rejected them.

Secretary Butler requested that the rationale be rewritten, because it portrays the minutes (and therefore the minute-taker) of being biased, inaccurate, and misleading. Since these are vices, she

took it as character assault. EB members disputed this characterization. It was stressed that these were potential problems created by detailed minutes.

President Wheeler moved to include the proposal on FS agenda (with a typographical correction). Senator Bennett-George seconded. The motion was adopted, 8 in favor and 3 against.

4.2. EB Minutes September 7, 2021

Senator Freeman said that he was the maker of the motion at the last EB meeting to postpone consideration of these minutes. He said that EB minutes belong to EB. Multiple times this semester, EB has requested that the secretary change how she was taking EB minutes, but there has not been change. The meeting was so long ago that Senator Freeman could not recall whether he had substantive concerns about the content of the minutes. Instead, his concern was that EB's request has been ignored.

Observing that there were no concerns about the content of the minutes, President-Elect Perkins moved to adopt the minutes. Senator Daniels seconded. The motion was adopted, with 1 dissent and 2 abstentions.

4.3. EB Minutes October 5, 2021

Senator Freeman said that he was the maker of the motion to postpone discussion of these minutes, for the same reasons as the previous minutes.

Concern was raised about a couple of sentences that presented conclusions. One was "But EB's actions did violate FS bylaws." The concern was that this seemed like a subjective statement from the secretary. EB members struck the sentence. Another paragraph concerned the discussion of whether to include the Rescind motion in FS agenda. The paragraph ended with the sentence, "That would set a bad precedent for the deliberative body." EB members did not think this represented the view of the entire EB and struck the sentence.

Senator Parsa moved to adopt the minutes. Secretary Butler seconded. The motion was adopted, with 10 in favor, 0 against, and 3 abstentions.

Afterwards, Secretary Butler confirmed that those paragraphs were conclusions spoken by the particular speakers.

5. Announcements

5.1. President

President Wheeler observed that the last FS meeting was passionate, and she hoped that people felt that they had the opportunity to say what they wanted. The majority voted against the Rescind motion, and now FS can move forward. The ad hoc committee is concluding its work and the new permanent committee is being formed. President Wheeler has discussed with AAC Chair Bennett-George and Ad Hoc Committee Chair Gillette who should be chair. She asked EB members to solicit suggestions, and asked caucus chairs to identify college representatives. She hopes that there will be an *ex officio* member from CELT and has asked Ad Hoc Committee Chair Gillette to serve in an *ex officio* capacity to help the transition.

President Wheeler and President-Elect Perkins agree that it is important to invest in our senators to help them develop skills to serve in leadership roles. There will be some workshops online, available to senators and P&S Council members. Each of the three workshops is 1.5 hours and address topics like how to make a good committee, how to listen, how to formulate good questions. The workshops are tentatively scheduled for February 1, March 22, and May 10. EB members expressed concern about the late date of the third workshop.

5.2. President-Elect

President-Elect Perkins said that he serves on a university task force about online learning strategy. The task force is composing its final report for the Provost's Office, and he hopes that it will be presented to the BOR task force as well.

At the next meeting, President-Elect Perkins will provide an update about the spring faculty conference.

5.3. Past President

None

5.4. Senior Vice President and Provost

Provost Wickert said that he would need to leave EB meeting early to attend a reception for term faculty in Reiman Gardens, joining Associate Provost Bratsch-Prince who had left the meeting earlier.

Earlier in the day, a federal judge in Georgia issued an injunction enjoining U.S. President Biden's executive order for federal contractors with respect to vaccines. The State of Iowa participated in some of the lawsuits that were the basis for the injunction. Expecting the executive order to go into effect in a week, ISU had been working to developing voluntary collection and safekeeping of vaccination status records. That work has been suspended, awaiting further instruction from the Board of Regents. Until those lawsuits are resolved, the executive order has no force.

Provost Wickert shared some positive indicators about admissions for next year, though numbers are not yet firm.

5.5. Council Chairs Reports

AAC: The name change proposal which was referred back to AAC by FS has not be discussed by AAC yet. There is a new policy change coming forward from Academic Standards and Admissions Committee. AAC is also discussing possible nominations for the U.S. Diversity standing committee. AAC has discussed the Science Communication certificate.

FDAR: The council approved guidelines for documenting efforts at diversity, equity, and inclusion. The guidelines stress that such documentation is voluntary, not mandatory. These guidelines will be posted on the Provost's website in the same area as guidance about Innovation and Entrepreneurship.

It was clarified that DEI activities should not be listed on PRSs. FDAR Council rejected that suggestion last year.

It was suggested that there would be greater buy-in from faculty if there were clear guidelines about what a faculty member needs to do to merit documenting DEI activities. For other areas of position responsibility, there are clear indicators of thresholds for what counts as performing that type of activity. In response to this, some EB members pointed out that there is no requirement to document DEI activity; the guidance provides clear examples of different types of DEI activities that might merit documentation or inclusion in a portfolio. Not all faculty members are engaged in DEI work, and so not all faculty members will find such guidance useful.

There was some difference of opinion among EB members about whether it would be good to have an optional line in annual evaluation reports about DEI activity. (The line could be left blank by a faculty member without penalty.)

A question was asked about FDAR's recommendations for COVID mitigation and COVID-adjusted policy changes for next semester. Senator Al Shihabi said that the Provost's Office is working with FDAR on that, and they will be able to address many of the faculty concerns. Senator Al Shihabi hoped that Associate Provost Bratsch-Prince could provide an update at a future EB meeting.

GOV: Governance Council has been working on problems that have arisen with term faculty policies. Before those policy changes, P&S staff who held rank-only faculty titles were usually rank-only assistant professors. Rank-only assistant professors have terminal degrees, conduct research, serve on POS committees, supervise graduate students and write their own grants. Now there has been a request to apply the term faculty titles to such P&S staff. This raises a host of questions. Could an advisor who teaches an orientation class request a rank-only title as assistant teaching professor, even if they do not have a terminal degree or conduct any other teaching? Advising is an activity that many faculty engage in. Does the assistant teaching professor title require any time in the classroom? This problem arises for only a small number of P&S staff, but finding the right fit has proved to be very difficult. Rank-only titles do not confer faculty status; these P&S staff are still classified as P&S staff and receive P&S benefits. Senator Freeman encouraged caucus chairs to raise the discussion in their caucuses, so that more stories can be shared about how different changes might affect people.

Senator Freeman said that a complicating factor is that the Graduate College allows nomination of Graduate faculty members without faculty appointments. It is possible to nominate a senior scientist with a Ph.D. to serve on a committee without having to provide them with a rank-only faculty title first.

Once a resolution is reached within Governance Council, the proposal will be sent to P&S Council for discussion. Senator Freeman said that this proposal is far from becoming FH policy.

Senator Freeman speculated that the end result might be a new classification, like "affiliate faculty," but for rank-only faculty who are on campus. "Adjunct" would likely not be appropriate, because of significant differences in roles. P&S staff can perform a significant range

of research, advising, and teaching (Senator Freeman thought the range was 30%) without being faculty.

RPA: Senator Oberhauser said that RPA Council has discussed faculty salary policy and merit raises and the budget model. A subcommittee is digging into data from the university to analyze faculty salary equity. They have also discussed policy and procedures about whether faculty can initiate investigation into whether their salary is equitable. Senator Oberhauser encouraged EB members to read an article in the recent EEO newsletter about gender pay inequity in higher education.

J&A: Senator Day said that one case is close to resolution. An ADHIC report is coming from another case. And in ten days, there will be another FS Committee on Appeals meeting.

It was asked whether the absence of an on-campus ombuds office has had an impact on the number or nature of cases. Senator Day said that he was unsure. Faculty who report having used the service said that their experiences were positive. An EB member clarified that employment-related appeals (e.g., faculty duties, pay, advancement) cannot be addressed through the ombuds office, but personal disputes may. Senator Day added that problems sometimes involve both, where the triggering event is a personal matter, which becomes an employment-related complaint, when the personal matter is unresolved.

5.6. Caucus Chair Reports

COD: Senator Muecke said that senators are discussing how to handle overlap between FS caucus and Liaison Council. The college governance document says that the caucus deals with external matters, and Liaison Council deals with internal matters. But in reality, those issues overlap. Eliminating Liaison Council would free smaller departments from having to find a representative.

The caucus is also discussing term limits for chairs, deans, and associate deans. Senator Muecke thanked the Business Caucus for examples of administrator evaluations.

Design faculty have encountered problems with winter session. Although the Provost's Office says that faculty cannot be forced into teaching over winter, some faculty are being forced to teach over winter. Senator Muecke wanted to raise awareness about this problem.

CALS: The CALS strategic plan expires in 2022, and initiative groups are being formed. Senator Hanson said that it is important for department chairs to present the guidelines to faculty about documenting DEI activities. She said that faculty have encountered difficulty finding information about pay equity and advancement.

CHS: Senator Gillette said that CHS faculty have discussed equity. There is no process for faculty to initiate investigation about whether their salary is equitable, and college-wide salary data are suppressed. Some faculty have been told that action would be taken, but then it is not. Faculty also feel that they were misinformed about the Retirement Incentive Option. Some lines are not being replaced, because a judgment is made that it is unnecessary to replace; their classes

are being assigned to existing faculty in the department, not a newly hired expert, and faculty are concerned that the quality of teaching is suffering.

COE: The caucus met with the deans on November 16. Senator Daniels said that the deans proposed a number of changes to the governance document, all of which faculty disagreed with, because those items do not need to be specified in the college governance document.

LAS: Senator Wallace sent a communication to the caucus this week, reminding senators to complete the dean review survey.

Senator Wallace added that FS will host regents on campus to shadow faculty. There will likely be four regents: Regent Bates, Regent Boettger, Regent Dakovich, and Regent Rause. Senator Wallace encouraged EB members to identify faculty with strong research and exciting projects. The program aims to have regents visit all colleges. Senator Al Shihabi said that there will be student presentations for IGNITE in April 18-22. Senator Bennett-George said that Fashion Show will be on April 9.

6. Approval of the December 14, 2021 Faculty Senate Agenda

Secretary Butler expressed concern that some special order presenters repeat information readily available on their websites. She thought that FS time might be better used by raising awareness about their programs or offices with a carefully worded e-mail.

Secretary Butler moved to remove the special order on “Cultivating Climate via Mindfulness and Reputation.” The motion was seconded and adopted without dissent.

The modified agenda was adopted without dissent.

7. Good of the Order

President-Elect Perkins encouraged EB members to consider running for president-elect or open council chairs.

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 5:08 p.m.